

# On the Engulfing Property for word hyperbolic groups

Ashot Minasyan

Université de Genève

# The profinite topology

Let  $G$  be a group. Consider the cosets to finite index normal subgroups as basic open subsets of  $G$ . Thus one obtains the **profinite topology**  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions

# The profinite topology

Let  $G$  be a group. Consider the cosets to finite index normal subgroups as basic open subsets of  $G$ . Thus one obtains the **profinite topology**  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

Studying the structure of a given subgroup  $H \leq G$  is much easier, if one knows that  $H$  is **closed** in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

## The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions

# The profinite topology

## The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions

Let  $G$  be a group. Consider the cosets to finite index normal subgroups as basic open subsets of  $G$ . Thus one obtains the **profinite topology**  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

Studying the structure of a given subgroup  $H \leq G$  is much easier, if one knows that  $H$  is **closed** in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

If  $H \leq G$ , define

$$H^* = \bigcap \{K \mid H \leq K \leq G, |G : K| < \infty\} - \text{closure of } H.$$

Then  $H = H^*$  iff  $H$  is **separable**.

# The profinite topology

## The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions

Let  $G$  be a group. Consider the cosets to finite index normal subgroups as basic open subsets of  $G$ . Thus one obtains the **profinite topology**  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

Studying the structure of a given subgroup  $H \leq G$  is much easier, if one knows that  $H$  is **closed** in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

If  $H \leq G$ , define

$$H^* = \bigcap \{K \mid H \leq K \leq G, |G : K| < \infty\} - \text{closure of } H.$$

Then  $H = H^*$  iff  $H$  is **separable**.

$G$  is **residually finite (RF)** if  $\{1\}$  is separable.

$G$  is **LERF** if every f.g. subgroup is closed in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

# The profinite topology

## The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions

Let  $G$  be a group. Consider the cosets to finite index normal subgroups as basic open subsets of  $G$ . Thus one obtains the **profinite topology**  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

Studying the structure of a given subgroup  $H \leq G$  is much easier, if one knows that  $H$  is **closed** in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

If  $H \leq G$ , define

$$H^* = \bigcap \{K \mid H \leq K \leq G, |G : K| < \infty\} - \text{closure of } H.$$

Then  $H = H^*$  iff  $H$  is **separable**.

$G$  is **residually finite (RF)** if  $\{1\}$  is separable.

$G$  is **LERF** if every f.g. subgroup is closed in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

Known examples of LERF groups include free groups, surface groups and fundamental groups of certain 3-manifolds.

In order to study separability properties of 3-manifold groups, D. Long gave the following definition:

**Def.**  $H \leq_{\neq} G$  is **engulfed** if  $\exists K \leq_{\neq} G$  such that  $H \leq K$  and  $|G : K| < \infty$ .

The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions

In order to study separability properties of 3-manifold groups, D. Long gave the following definition:

**Def.**  $H \leq_{\neq} G$  is **engulfed** if  $\exists K \leq_{\neq} G$  such that  $H \leq K$  and  $|G : K| < \infty$ .

**Thm. (Long, 1988).** Let  $G$  be a fundamental group of a closed hyp. 3-manifold. Suppose that  $G$  engulfs every f.g.  $M \leq G$  with  $\Lambda(M) \subsetneq S_{\infty}^2$ . Then  $\forall H \leq_{g.f.} G$  one has  $|H^* : H| < \infty$ .



In order to study separability properties of 3-manifold groups, D. Long gave the following definition:

**Def.**  $H \leq_{\neq} G$  is **engulfed** if  $\exists K \leq_{\neq} G$  such that  $H \leq K$  and  $|G : K| < \infty$ .

**Thm. (Long, 1988).** Let  $G$  be a fundamental group of a closed hyp. 3-manifold. Suppose that  $G$  engulfs every f.g.  $M \leq G$  with  $\Lambda(M) \subsetneq S_{\infty}^2$ . Then  $\forall H \leq_{g.f.} G$  one has  $|H^* : H| < \infty$ .

Motivating the above result, Long noted that proving that a f.g. subgroup is engulfed may be much easier than showing that it is separable.

# Generalization to hyperbolic groups

Assume, now, that  $G$  is **word hyperbolic** in the sense of Gromov and  $\partial G$  is the **visual boundary** of  $G$ .

The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions

# Generalization to hyperbolic groups

Assume, now, that  $G$  is **word hyperbolic** in the sense of Gromov and  $\partial G$  is the **visual boundary** of  $G$ .

**Thm. A (Niblo-Williams, 2002).** Suppose that  $G$  engulfs every f.g. free subgroup  $F$  with  $\Lambda(F) \subsetneq \partial G$ . Then  $\bigcap \{K \mid |G : K| < \infty\}$  is finite. If  $G$  is torsion-free then it is residually finite.

The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions

# Generalization to hyperbolic groups

The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions

Assume, now, that  $G$  is **word hyperbolic** in the sense of Gromov and  $\partial G$  is the **visual boundary** of  $G$ .

**Thm. A (Niblo-Williams, 2002).** Suppose that  $G$  engulfs every f.g. free subgroup  $F$  with  $\Lambda(F) \subsetneq \partial G$ . Then  $\bigcap \{K \mid |G : K| < \infty\}$  is finite. If  $G$  is torsion-free then it is residually finite.

**Def.** A subset  $Q \subset G$  is called **quasiconvex** if  $\exists \varepsilon \geq 0$  such that  $\forall x, y \in Q, [x, y] \subset \mathcal{N}_\varepsilon(Q)$  in the Cayley graph of  $G$ .

# Generalization to hyperbolic groups

The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions

Assume, now, that  $G$  is **word hyperbolic** in the sense of Gromov and  $\partial G$  is the **visual boundary** of  $G$ .

**Thm. A (Niblo-Williams, 2002).** Suppose that  $G$  engulfs every f.g. free subgroup  $F$  with  $\Lambda(F) \subsetneq \partial G$ . Then  $\bigcap \{K \mid |G : K| < \infty\}$  is finite. If  $G$  is torsion-free then it is residually finite.

**Def.** A subset  $Q \subset G$  is called **quasiconvex** if  $\exists \varepsilon \geq 0$  such that  $\forall x, y \in Q$ ,  $[x, y] \subset \mathcal{N}_\varepsilon(Q)$  in the Cayley graph of  $G$ .

**Thm. B (Niblo-Williams, 2002).** If  $G$  engulfs every f.g. subgroup  $M$  with  $\Lambda(M) \subsetneq \partial G$ , then  $\forall H \leq_{q.c.} G$  one has  $|H^* : H| < \infty$ .

# Generalization to hyperbolic groups

The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions

Assume, now, that  $G$  is **word hyperbolic** in the sense of Gromov and  $\partial G$  is the **visual boundary** of  $G$ .

**Thm. A (Niblo-Williams, 2002).** Suppose that  $G$  engulfs every f.g. free subgroup  $F$  with  $\Lambda(F) \subsetneq \partial G$ . Then  $\bigcap \{K \mid |G : K| < \infty\}$  is finite. If  $G$  is torsion-free then it is residually finite.

**Def.** A subset  $Q \subset G$  is called **quasiconvex** if  $\exists \varepsilon \geq 0$  such that  $\forall x, y \in Q$ ,  $[x, y] \subset \mathcal{N}_\varepsilon(Q)$  in the Cayley graph of  $G$ .

**Thm. B (Niblo-Williams, 2002).** If  $G$  engulfs every f.g. subgroup  $M$  with  $\Lambda(M) \subsetneq \partial G$ , then  $\forall H \leq_{q.c.} G$  one has  $|H^* : H| < \infty$ .

**Remark.** It is easy to construct a non-q.c. sbgp.  $H$  such that  $|G : H| = \infty$  and  $H^* = G$ .

Consider the following three properties of a hyp. gp.  $G$ :

- The profinite topology
- Engulfing
- Generalization to hyp. groups
- Main Results**
- Proof in a special case
- Open Questions

Consider the following three properties of a hyp. gp.  $G$ :

(FEP) Each proper free q.c. sbgp. of rank  $s$  is engulfed  
(where  $s = \text{rank}(G)$ ).

The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions



Consider the following three properties of a hyp. gp.  $G$ :

(FEP) Each proper free q.c. sbgp. of rank  $s$  is engulfed  
(where  $s = \text{rank}(G)$ ).

(EP) Each proper q.c. sbgp. is engulfed.

Consider the following three properties of a hyp. gp.  $G$ :

(FEP) Each proper free q.c. sbgp. of rank  $s$  is engulfed  
(where  $s = \text{rank}(G)$ ).

(EP) Each proper q.c. sbgp. is engulfed.

(GFERF) Each q.c. sbgp. is closed in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

Consider the following three properties of a hyp. gp.  $G$ :

(FEP) Each proper free q.c. sbgp. of rank  $s$  is engulfed  
(where  $s = \text{rank}(G)$ ).

(EP) Each proper q.c. sbgp. is engulfed.

(GFERF) Each q.c. sbgp. is closed in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

Thm. 1 (M., 2005). FEP  $\Rightarrow \bigcap \{K \mid |G : K| < \infty\}$  is finite. If  $G$  is torsion-free (TF) then it is residually finite (RF).

Consider the following three properties of a hyp. gp.  $G$ :

(FEP) Each proper free q.c. sbgp. of rank  $s$  is engulfed (where  $s = \text{rank}(G)$ ).

(EP) Each proper q.c. sbgp. is engulfed.

(GFERF) Each q.c. sbgp. is closed in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

Thm. 1 (M., 2005). FEP  $\Rightarrow \bigcap \{K \mid |G : K| < \infty\}$  is finite. If  $G$  is torsion-free (TF) then it is residually finite (RF).

Thm. 2 (M., 2005). EP  $\Rightarrow \forall H \leq_{q.c.} G$  one has  $|H^* : H| < \infty$ .

Consider the following three properties of a hyp. gp.  $G$ :

(FEP) Each proper free q.c. sbgp. of rank  $s$  is engulfed (where  $s = \text{rank}(G)$ ).

(EP) Each proper q.c. sbgp. is engulfed.

(GFERF) Each q.c. sbgp. is closed in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

Thm. 1 (M., 2005).  $\text{FEP} \Rightarrow \bigcap \{K \mid |G : K| < \infty\}$  is finite. If  $G$  is torsion-free (TF) then it is residually finite (RF).

Thm. 2 (M., 2005).  $\text{EP} \Rightarrow \forall H \leq_{q.c.} G$  one has  $|H^* : H| < \infty$ .

Thm. 3 (M., 2005).  $\text{EP} \ \& \ \text{RF} \Rightarrow \text{GFERF}$ .

Consider the following three properties of a hyp. gp.  $G$ :

(FEP) Each proper free q.c. subgp. of rank  $s$  is engulfed (where  $s = \text{rank}(G)$ ).

(EP) Each proper q.c. subgp. is engulfed.

(GFERF) Each q.c. subgp. is closed in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

Thm. 1 (M., 2005).  $\text{FEP} \Rightarrow \bigcap \{K \mid |G : K| < \infty\}$  is finite. If  $G$  is torsion-free (TF) then it is residually finite (RF).

Thm. 2 (M., 2005).  $\text{EP} \Rightarrow \forall H \leq_{q.c.} G$  one has  $|H^* : H| < \infty$ .

Thm. 3 (M., 2005).  $\text{EP} \ \& \ \text{RF} \Rightarrow \text{GFERF}$ .

Cor. 1 (M., 2005).  $\text{EP} \ \& \ \text{TF} \Rightarrow \text{GFERF}$ .

Consider the following three properties of a hyp. gp.  $G$ :

(FEP) Each proper free q.c. subgp. of rank  $s$  is engulfed (where  $s = \text{rank}(G)$ ).

(EP) Each proper q.c. subgp. is engulfed.

(GFERF) Each q.c. subgp. is closed in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

Thm. 1 (M., 2005). FEP  $\Rightarrow \bigcap \{K \mid |G : K| < \infty\}$  is finite. If  $G$  is torsion-free (TF) then it is residually finite (RF).

Thm. 2 (M., 2005). EP  $\Rightarrow \forall H \leq_{q.c.} G$  one has  $|H^* : H| < \infty$ .

Thm. 3 (M., 2005). EP & RF  $\Rightarrow$  GFERF.

Cor. 2 (M., 2005). EP  $\Rightarrow \forall H \leq_{q.c.} G$ ,  $H^* = HQ$  where  $Q = \bigcap \{K \mid |G : K| < \infty\}$ .

# Proof in a special case

Thm. 2.  $EP \Rightarrow \forall H \leq_{q.c.} G$  one has  $|H^* : H| < \infty$ .

Cor. 1.  $EP \ \& \ TF \Rightarrow GFERF$ .

---

The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions



# Proof in a special case

- The profinite topology
- Engulfing
- Generalization to hyp. groups
- Main Results
- Proof in a special case
- Open Questions

**Thm. 2.**  $EP \Rightarrow \forall H \leq_{q.c.} G$  one has  $|H^* : H| < \infty$ .

**Cor. 1.**  $EP \ \& \ TF \Rightarrow GFERF$ .

---

**Proof of Thm. 2  $\Rightarrow$  Cor. 1.** Assume  $G \models (EP \ \& \ TF)$ .  
Let  $H \leq_{q.c.} G$ ,  $|G : H| = \infty$  and suppose that  $H \not\leq H^*$ .

# Proof in a special case

- The profinite topology
- Engulfing
- Generalization to hyp. groups
- Main Results
- Proof in a special case
- Open Questions

Thm. 2.  $EP \Rightarrow \forall H \leq_{q.c.} G$  one has  $|H^* : H| < \infty$ .

Cor. 1.  $EP \ \& \ TF \Rightarrow GFERF$ .

Proof of Thm. 2  $\Rightarrow$  Cor. 1. Assume  $G \models (EP \ \& \ TF)$ .  
Let  $H \leq_{q.c.} G$ ,  $|G : H| = \infty$  and suppose that  $H \not\leq H^*$ .  
Thm. 2  $\Rightarrow |H^* : H| < \infty$ , hence  $H^*$  is also q.c.

# Proof in a special case

- The profinite topology
- Engulfing
- Generalization to hyp. groups
- Main Results
- Proof in a special case
- Open Questions

**Thm. 2.**  $EP \Rightarrow \forall H \leq_{q.c.} G$  one has  $|H^* : H| < \infty$ .

**Cor. 1.**  $EP \ \& \ TF \Rightarrow GFERF$ .

**Proof of  $\boxed{\text{Thm. 2} \Rightarrow \text{Cor. 1}}$ .** Assume  $G \models (EP \ \& \ TF)$ .  
Let  $H \leq_{q.c.} G$ ,  $|G : H| = \infty$  and suppose that  $H \not\leq H^*$ .

$\text{Thm. 2} \Rightarrow |H^* : H| < \infty$ , hence  $H^*$  is also q.c.

**G. Arzhantseva (2001):**  $\exists g \in G$  s.t.  $B = \langle g, H^* \rangle \cong \langle g \rangle * H^*$   
and  $A = \langle g, H \rangle$  is q.c. in  $G$ . In particular,  $|B : A| = \infty$ .

# Proof in a special case

- The profinite topology
- Engulfing
- Generalization to hyp. groups
- Main Results
- Proof in a special case
- Open Questions

**Thm. 2.**  $EP \Rightarrow \forall H \leq_{q.c.} G$  one has  $|H^* : H| < \infty$ .

**Cor. 1.**  $EP \ \& \ TF \Rightarrow GFERF$ .

**Proof of Thm. 2  $\Rightarrow$  Cor. 1.** Assume  $G \models (EP \ \& \ TF)$ .  
Let  $H \leq_{q.c.} G$ ,  $|G : H| = \infty$  and suppose that  $H \not\leq_{\neq} H^*$ .

$Thm. 2 \Rightarrow |H^* : H| < \infty$ , hence  $H^*$  is also q.c.

**G. Arzhantseva (2001):**  $\exists g \in G$  s.t.  $B = \langle g, H^* \rangle \cong \langle g \rangle * H^*$   
and  $A = \langle g, H \rangle$  is q.c. in  $G$ . In particular,  $|B : A| = \infty$ .

$Thm. 2 \Rightarrow |A^* : A| < \infty$ . Evidently,  $B \leq A^*$ , thus  
 $|B : A| < \infty$  – a contradiction.  $\square$

# Open Questions

(EP) Each proper q.c. sbgp. is engulfed.

(GFERF) Each q.c. sbgp. is closed in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

---

The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions

# Open Questions

The profinite topology  
Engulfing  
Generalization to hyp. groups  
Main Results  
Proof in a special case  
Open Questions

(EP) Each proper q.c. sbgp. is engulfed.

(GFERF) Each q.c. sbgp. is closed in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

---

Q.1. If  $G \models \text{EP}$ , is it true that  $G * \mathbb{Z} \models \text{EP}$  ?

The positive answer would show that  $\text{EP} \Rightarrow \text{RF}$ .

# Open Questions

The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions

(EP) Each proper q.c. sbgp. is engulfed.

(GFERF) Each q.c. sbgp. is closed in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

---

Q.1. If  $G \models \text{EP}$ , is it true that  $G * \mathbb{Z} \models \text{EP}$  ?

The positive answer would show that  $\text{EP} \Rightarrow \text{RF}$ .

Q.2. Does there exists a hyp. gp.  $G$  which is not GFERF ?

# Open Questions

The profinite topology

Engulfing

Generalization to hyp. groups

Main Results

Proof in a special case

Open Questions

(EP) Each proper q.c. sbgp. is engulfed.

(GFERF) Each q.c. sbgp. is closed in  $\mathcal{PT}(G)$ .

---

Q.1. If  $G \models \text{EP}$ , is it true that  $G * \mathbb{Z} \models \text{EP}$  ?

The positive answer would show that  $\text{EP} \Rightarrow \text{RF}$ .

Q.2. Does there exist a hyp. gp.  $G$  which is not GFERF ?

Q.3. Let  $G$  be a hyperbolic mapping torus of a free group, i.e.,

$$G = HNN_{\varphi}(F(X)) \text{ where } \varphi : F(X) \hookrightarrow F(X).$$

Does  $G$  have EP ?